

Section III – Items for the Information of the Board

TO: Chair and Members of the Board of Directors
Meeting #6/20, Friday, September 25, 2020

FROM: Michael Tolensky, Chief Financial and Operating Officer

RE: **SCARBOROUGH WATERFRONT PROJECT DETAILED DESIGN AND
SCARBOROUGH BLUFFS WEST INDIVIDUAL ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT UPDATE**

KEY ISSUE

Update on the status of the Scarborough Bluffs West Individual Environmental Assessment (EA) project and the status of Scarborough Waterfront Project West Segment detailed design procurement process, including the Brimley Road South Multi-Use Trail (Request for Proposal RFP No. 10034734), and the West Segment Shoreline and Multi-Use Trail (RFP No. 10034817).

RECOMMENDATIONS

WHEREAS Toronto and Region Conservation Authority (TRCA), in partnership with the City of Toronto, undertook an Individual Environmental Assessment (EA) to create a system of greenspaces along the Lake Ontario shoreline between Bluffer's Park and East Point Park in Toronto that will respect and protect the significant natural and cultural features of the Bluffs, enhance the terrestrial and aquatic habitat, and provide a safe and enjoyable waterfront experience (the Scarborough Waterfront Project);

WHEREAS TRCA received funding of \$4.895 million over two years as part of the 2019 City Budget process to refine the preliminary overall costing for the entire SWP EA and report to the City for the City Council-approved stage 2 stage gating review, as well as complete the detailed design of the West Segment, which includes the funding required for the Brimley Road South multi-use trail detailed design and construction;

WHEREAS TRCA received approval for the Final SWP EA Report from the Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks (MECP) on November 6, 2019;

WHEREAS TRCA received approval from the Board of Directors on November 29, 2019, and subsequently May 22, 2020, to proceed with the detailed design of the West Segment of the SWP, including the design of the Brimley Road South multi-use trail, based on the concept approved through the Individual EA process;

WHEREAS the CEO was delegated authority by the Board of Directors on May 22, 2020 to award the West Segment detailed design RFPs if the procurement process was complete and fell within the summer hiatus period;

AND WHEREAS staff, in consultation with key City of Toronto staff, finalized and solicited two (2) RFPs for the Brimley Road South multi-use trail, and the West Segment shoreline and multi-use trail, through a publicly advertised process, with the Brimley Road South multi-use trail procurement process completed and approved by the CEO on August 27, 2020, and the West Segment shoreline and multi-use trail procurement process completed and approved by the CEO on September 16, 2020;

Item 9.6

THEREFORE LET IT BE RESOLVED THAT the following update on the Scarborough Waterfront Project and Scarborough Bluffs West Individual EA be received, including the award of Contract No. 10034734 for the Detailed Design of the Brimley Road South Multi-Use Trail to McIntosh Perry Consulting Engineers Ltd. for a total cost not to exceed \$238,474 plus 10% contingency, plus applicable taxes, and the award of Contract No. 10034817 for the Detailed Design of the West Segment Shoreline and Multi-Use Trail to Shoreplan Engineering Ltd. for a total cost not to exceed \$1,108,170 plus 10% contingency, plus applicable taxes, as authorized by the CEO;

THAT an update on the status for the SWP be brought forward to the Board of Directors following completion of the West Segment detailed design phase;

THAT TRCA staff work with City of Toronto staff to secure budget to allow implementation of the West Segment shoreline works and initiation of the Central Segment detailed design phase;

AND FURTHER THAT an update on the status of the Scarborough Bluffs West Individual EA project and any required approvals be brought to the Board of Directors for their consideration in the Spring of 2021 or earlier should new direction from the City of Toronto be given.

BACKGROUND

Scarborough Waterfront Project

TRCA, in partnership with the City of Toronto, initiated a study in 2014 under the *Environmental Assessment Act (EA Act)* with a vision to create a system of public greenspaces along the Lake Ontario shoreline between Bluffer's Park and East Point Park, which respect and protect the significant natural and cultural features of the Bluffs, enhance terrestrial and aquatic habitat, and provide a safe and enjoyable waterfront experience.

In May 2018, TRCA received approval from the City of Toronto Executive Committee, and subsequently City Council (Resolution EX34.5), to submit the final Scarborough Waterfront Project Environmental Assessment (EA) to the Ministry of Environment and Climate Change (MOECC) for formal review. TRCA was also directed by Council to report back with preliminary costing for the design and implementation of each project area shoreline segment (West, Central and East), subject to a favourable decision from MOECC, and that cost estimates for the erosion control components, multi-use trail and the waterfront access, along with any funding eligibility criteria, be provided by TRCA as part of the completed stage-gate 3 class 3 costing and detailed design of each of the three shoreline segments.

On November 6, 2019 TRCA received a letter from Minister Yurek, approving the Scarborough Waterfront EA. Earlier in 2019, City Council approved funding of \$4.895M to advance the West Segment detailed design process and to start construction on the Brimley Road South pedestrian improvements. TRCA, in continued partnership with the City of Toronto, is proceeding with the detailed design of the West Segment of the Scarborough Waterfront Project in 2020. Given the necessity to improve pedestrian and cyclist safety along Brimley Road, the Brimley Road South multi-use trail work is the priority in the West Segment detailed design process.

Item 9.6

Since March 2020, TRCA staff have been working with key staff from City Transportation, Water and Parks, Forestry and Recreation divisions to complete the RFPs for both the Brimley Road South multi-use trail and the West Segment shoreline works. The two RFPs were finalized and released in July and August 2020, respectively.

Scarborough Bluffs West

At City Council Meeting #11 on December 9 and 10, 2015, Resolution EX10.23 was passed which directed City Council, through the Capital Budget, to include a \$2 million Toronto Water Capital Reserve contribution towards the Scarborough Bluffs West Individual EA, cash flowed over the 2 or 3-year life of the project. This resolution would see the initiation of an Individual EA similar to the Scarborough Waterfront Project for the shoreline from Bluffer's Park west to R.C. Harris Water Treatment Plant. As the Scarborough Waterfront Project was in the middle of a comprehensive consultation process at this time a mutual decision between TRCA and the City was made to delay the new EA until the active planning process was complete to eliminate potential public confusion.

In order to best position the launch of the future Scarborough Bluff West EA, baseline studies and environmental monitoring in support of the project were completed between 2016 and 2019 and include: terrestrial and aquatic ecology surveys; coastal condition studies; and terrestrial and marine archaeology studies. Under direction received from Toronto Water in February 2020, the project was put on hold until further discussions with appropriate City of Toronto divisions is undertaken to determine next steps for the EA. After on-going dialogue with Toronto Water, \$50,000 has now been secured to continue with the baseline environmental monitoring for 2020.

RATIONALE

Scarborough Waterfront Project

TRCA, in partnership with key divisions of the City is proceeding with detailed design of the West Segment of the Scarborough Waterfront Project. The West Segment boundaries are between Bluffer's Park and the start of the Meadowcliffe Drive Erosion Control Project. Work will include additional engineering and technical analysis, as well as and construction phasing and costing for the following components: the proposed expanded headlands at Bluffer's Park and Meadowcliffe, the expansion of Bluffer's Park Beach, and a multi-use trail through the Segment, including improvements to Brimley Road South and construction of a separated multi-use trail along the east side of Brimley, south of Barkdene Hills to Bluffer's Park. Given the necessity to improve pedestrian and cyclist safety along Brimley Road, the Brimley Road South multi-use trail work will be a first priority in the West Segment detailed design process. In order to best facilitate the planning process moving forward, the detailed design exercise for the West Segment has been split into two RFP processes: Brimley Road South Multi-Use Trail, and West Segment Shoreline and Multi-Use Trail.

TRCA staff, in consultation with key staff from City of Toronto's Transportation Services, Toronto Water and Parks, Forestry and Recreation divisions, finalized and released both RFPs in July and August 2020, respectively.

Item 9.6

Brimley Road South Multi-Use Trail

RFP documentation was posted on the public procurement website www.biddingo.com on July 3, 2020 and closed on July 23, 2020. One (1) addendum was issued to respond to questions received. A total of thirty-nine (39) firms downloaded the documents and four (4) proposals were received from the following Proponent(s):

- GHD Limited
- Lithos Group Inc.
- McIntosh Perry Consulting Engineers Ltd.
- WSP Canada Group Ltd.

The proposal from Lithos Group Inc. was disqualified due to:

- the lack of a detailed work breakdown with staff hour allocations in the technical proposal, resulting in the inability of the Evaluation Committee to evaluate the “appropriate allocation of staff resources” criteria; and,
- the intentional omission of a number of required elements requested to be in the scope of work, resulting in the inability of the Evaluation Committee to compare the Lithos Group Inc. fee proposal with the fee proposals received from the other three (3) Proponents that addressed the full scope of work.

An Evaluation Committee comprised of staff from TRCA’s Project Management Office and the City of Toronto’s Transportation Services and Parks, Forestry and Recreation divisions reviewed the proposals. The criteria used to evaluate and select the recommended Proponent included the following:

Criteria	Description	Weight
Understanding of Project and Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Demonstrated understanding of the project, background, requirements, linkages, challenges, etc. 	10
Similar Projects – Scope and Magnitude	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quantity and quality of projects of similar budget and scope 	10
Expertise and Availability of Project Team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appropriate allocation of staff resources • Qualifications and experience of consultants and sub-consultants, including specified designations (i.e., PEO and full OALA member with stamp) • Project Manager’s qualifications and experience 	15
Approach/Methodology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed description of the work plan • Innovative ideas and approaches to meeting the project objectives • Identification of project limitations or difficulties and proposed solutions 	30
Schedule	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Schedule and timelines consistent with project requirements • Ability to commit to timing objectives 	10
Sub-Total		75
Pricing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Total project cost, relative to all submitted proposals 	25
Sub-Total		25
Total Points		100

Item 9.6

The bid received from McIntosh Perry Consulting Engineers Ltd. was determined to best meet the requirements, as outlined in the RFP documents, and was also of reasonable value given the scope of work identified. Further assessment by TRCA staff of McIntosh Perry Consulting Engineers Ltd.'s experience and ability to undertake similar projects was conducted through reference checks which resulted in positive feedback that McIntosh Perry Consulting Engineers Ltd. is capable of undertaking the required scope of work.

At Board of Directors meeting #4/20, held on May 22, 2020, RES.#A60/20 provided delegated authority to TRCA's CEO to award the RFP if the procurement process was complete and fell within the summer hiatus period. As such, TRCA's CEO authorized the award of Contract No. 10034747 to McIntosh Perry Consulting Engineers Ltd. at a total cost not to exceed \$238,747 plus 10% contingency, plus applicable taxes. Proponent's scores and staff analysis of the evaluation results can be provided in an in-camera presentation, upon request.

West Segment Shoreline and Multi-Use Trail

RFP documentation was posted on the public procurement website www.biddingo.com on August 17, 2020 and closed on September 4, 2020. One (1) addendum was issued to respond to questions received. A total of thirty-nine (39) firms downloaded the documents and two (2) proposals were received from the following Proponent(s):

- Shoreplan Engineering Ltd.
- W.F. Baird & Associates Coastal Engineers Ltd.

An Evaluation Committee comprised of staff from TRCA's Project Management Office and Engineering Projects business units reviewed the proposals. The criteria used to evaluate and select the recommended Proponent included the following:

Criteria	Description	Weight
Understanding of Project and Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demonstrated understanding of the project, background, requirements, linkages, challenges, etc. 	10
Similar Projects – Scope and Magnitude	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quantity and quality of projects of similar budget and scope 	10
Expertise and Availability of Project Team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appropriate allocation of staff resources Qualifications and experience of consultants and sub-consultants, including specified designations (i.e., PEO and full OALA member with stamp) Project Manager's qualifications and experience 	15
Approach/Methodology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed description of the work plan Innovative ideas and approaches to meeting the project objectives Identification of project limitations or difficulties and proposed solutions 	30
Schedule	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Schedule and timelines consistent with project requirements Ability to commit to timing objectives 	10
Sub-Total		75
Pricing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Total project cost, relative to all submitted proposals 	25
Sub-Total		25
Total Points		100

Item 9.6

As both proposals received the same overall score, the final overall ranking was determined by the bid that received the highest technical proposal score. The bid received from Shoreplan Engineering Ltd. was determined to best meet the requirements, as outlined in the RFP documents, and was also of reasonable value given the scope of work identified. Based on the Proponent's past work on the SWP EA, in addition to further assessment by TRCA staff of Shoreplan Engineering Ltd.'s experience and ability to undertake similar projects conducted through reference checks which resulted in positive feedback, it was determined that Shoreplan Engineering Ltd. is the most appropriate and qualified Proponent for undertaking the required scope of work.

At Board of Directors meeting #4/20, held on May 22, 2020, RES.#A60/20 provided delegated authority to TRCA's CEO to award the RFP if the procurement process was complete and fell within the summer hiatus period. As such, TRCA's CEO authorized the award of Contract No. 10034817 to Shoreplan Engineering Ltd. at a total cost not to exceed \$1,108,170 plus 10% contingency, plus applicable taxes. Proponent's scores and staff analysis of the evaluation results can be provided in an in-camera presentation, upon request.

Relationship to Building the Living City, the TRCA 2013-2022 Strategic Plan

This report supports the following strategies set forth in the TRCA 2013-2022 Strategic Plan:

Strategy 2 – Manage our regional water resources for current and future generations

Strategy 3 – Rethink greenspace to maximize its value

Strategy 5 – Foster sustainable citizenship

FINANCIAL DETAILS

Scarborough Waterfront Project

The total capital investment for the SWP is estimated to be \$170 million, over a 12-year implementation period, and additional post-implementation reporting and monitoring. Given the conceptual level of detail considered in the EA, and annual inflation over the course of the Project, the estimated capital investment includes a healthy contingency of 50%. The total capital investment will continue to be refined during the detailed design process, as concepts are further refined.

As per the staff report submitted to the May 14, 2018 City Executive Committee, and subsequently to City Council on May 22, 23 and 24, 2018, this Project will follow the City Council-approved "stage gate" capital planning and approval process. The work undertaken to date confirms the conceptual feasibility of the Project (stage 1). As part of detailed design, TRCA staff will undertake the work required to establish preliminary design and costs associated with the second stage of the process. Detailed costs for each Segment of the Project that would identify the eligibility of funding sources (i.e. erosion control separate from waterfront access and environmental enhancements) is not yet available. Confirmation of these cost estimates requires the 30% detailed design to be completed at the third stage of the City's stage gating process (stage gate 3, class 3 costing) in conjunction with relevant City Programs.

As part of the 2019 Budget process received funding of \$4.895 million to complete the refined preliminary costing of the entire Project, as well as detailed design of the West Segment, which includes the funding required for the Brimley Road South multi-use trail detailed design and construction.

Item 9.6

Based on the results of the West Segment detailed design RFP processes, the total cost for consultant services associated with the detailed design of the Brimley Road South multi-use trail, and the West Segment shoreline and multi-use trail, is \$1,346,917, plus 10% contingency, plus applicable taxes. TRCA project management and technical support costs have been budgeted as approximately \$830,000 over two years. Considering all applicable taxes and the contingency, the grand total for the West Segment detailed design for external and internal services is \$2,502,760. This leaves \$2,392,240 in the existing budget approved by the City of Toronto, which is expected to be sufficient to cover the costs of constructing the multi-use trail on Brimley Road South. Costs for construction will be further refined through detailed design. Funds are being tracked through the 204-17 account code.

Scarborough Bluffs West

City Council has authorized \$2 million for the Scarborough Bluffs West Individual EA supported by Toronto Water. To date \$1.432 million has been spent from the \$2 million allocation leaving \$0.568 million remaining. Toronto Water did an inter-budget transfer of \$1 million of these funds to the SWP to complete the EA; \$382,000 was spent to undertake annual baseline environmental monitoring (2016 – 2019) in support of the future West EA; and \$50,000 has recently been approved for baseline environmental monitoring in 2020. It is anticipated that the Scarborough Bluffs West EA would cost approximately \$3.5 million from launch to completion over a period of three or more years based on the experience with the SWP. This means a gap of \$2.932 million in funding currently exists. This project has been included on the unmet needs list for the City of Toronto capital budget since 2016.

Toronto Water has indicated that they cannot move forward with an agreement with TRCA to undertake the EA until discussions with other key City divisions are undertaken to discuss the funding gap. The continuation of baseline environmental monitoring work in 2020 will help to ensure the EA is in the best possible state for a future launch.

DETAILS OF WORK TO BE DONE

As requested by City Council, TRCA will refine the preliminary overall costing for the entire SWP during detailed design and will report to the City for the City Council-approved stage 2 stage gating review. TRCA staff have requested a meeting with key City divisions to confirm how project costing and cash flows are to be established and refined to maintain alignment with the City's stage-gate process for a report back to Council.

Following the completion of the West Segment detailed design phase (late Fall/ early Winter 2021), an update on the status of the SWP will be brought forward to the Board of Directors to present the refined construction costing along with a request for authorization to proceed with any next steps requiring Board approval.

TRCA staff will continue to engage the City in discussions around proceeding with the formal initiation of the Scarborough Bluffs West Individual EA. An update on the status of this EA will be brought to the Board of Directors when direction is obtained from the City of Toronto.

Report prepared by: Katherine Hills Learney, extension 5913

Emails: katherine.learney@trca.ca

For Information contact: Lisa Turnbull, extension 5645

Emails: lisa.turnbull@trca.ca

Attachments: 3

Attachment 1: Scarborough Waterfront Project and Scarborough Bluffs West Study Area

Attachment 2: Refined West Segment Preferred Alternative

Attachment 3: Proposed Path Along Brimley Road South